



TAMI RITTER, CHAIR
Supervisor, District #3

ADDISON WINSLOW, VICE CHAIR
Councilmember, Chico

BILL CONNELLY
Supervisor, District #1

PETER DURFEE
Supervisor, District #2

TOD KIMMELSHUE
Supervisor, District #4

DOUG TEETER
Supervisor, District #5

CHUCK NUCHOLS
Vice Mayor, Biggs

ANGEL CALDERON
Councilmember, Gridley

ERIC SMITH
Vice Mayor, Oroville

ROSE TRYON
Councilmember, Paradise

STEPHEN ERTL
Air Pollution Control Officer

PATRICK LUCEY
Assistant Air Pollution Control Officer

Final Minutes of the Butte County Air Quality Management District Governing Board of Directors Meeting of January 25, 2024

Members Present:

Bill Connelly	Supervisor, District 1
Peter Durfee	Supervisor, District 2
Tami Ritter	Supervisor, District 3
Chuck Nuchols	Vice Mayor, Biggs
Addison Winslow	Councilmember, Chico
Eric Smith	Vice Mayor, Oroville
Rose Tryon	Councilmember, Town of Paradise

Members Absent:

Angel Calderon	Councilmember, Gridley
Doug Teeter	Supervisor, District 5
Tod Kimmelshue	Supervisor, District 4

Staff Present:

Stephen Ertle	Air Pollution Control Officer
Riley Peacock	Air Quality Engineer
Kelly Towne	Clerk of the Board
Patrick Lucey	Assistant Air Pollution Control Officer

Staff Remote:

Sam Nassie	Air Quality Compliance Specialist
Jason Mandly	Senior Air Quality Planner
Ursula Parker	Senior Air Quality Compliance Specialist

Due to the COVID-19 pandemic, members of the public are encouraged to attend the meeting using Zoom. Public comments were accepted before and during the meeting by emailing ktowne@bcaqmd.org.

1. Call to Order and Roll Call.

Chair Pro Tem Ritter called the meeting to order at 10:00 a.m. at the BCAG Board Room, 326 Huss Drive, Suite 100, Chico, California.

Agenda Item 5.1

2. Consider Election of Butte County Air Quality Management District Officers for 2024.

ACTION REQUESTED: Existing Chair Ritter, named as Chair Pro Tem, to oversee the election of a Chair and Vice Chair for calendar year 2024.

A motion was made by Supervisor Connelly and seconded by Supervisor Durfee to re-elect Supervisor Ritter as Chair.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly(motion) Supervisor Durfee(second), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow, Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

A motion was made by Supervisor Connelly and seconded by Supervisor Durfee to elect Councilmember Winslow as Vice Chair.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly(motion), Supervisor Durfee(second), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow, Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

Supervisor Ritter served as Chair for the remainder of the meeting.

3. Welcome to New Board Members.

All Board members remained the same for 2024.

4. Additions and Deletions to the Consent or Regular Agenda.

No additions or deletions.

5. Consent Agenda.

- 5.1** Minutes of the December 7, 2023, Meeting of the Board of Directors.
- 5.2** Activity Report on Butte County Air Quality Management District Activities.
- 5.3** Financial Status Report for Fiscal Year 2023-2024.
- 5.4** FY 23-24 2nd Quarter Grant Revenue Report
- 5.5** Status Report on Calendar of Events.
- 5.6** Status Report on Communications.
- 5.7** AB617 Implementation Grant Resolution

ACTION REQUESTED: Approve Consent Agenda Items.

Board comments: None
Public comments: None

A motion was made by Councilmember Winslow and seconded by Supervisor Durfee to approve the Consent Agenda Items.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Durfee(second), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow(motion), Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

ITEMS FOR ACTION

6. Items removed from the Consent Agenda for Board consideration and actions.

No items removed from the Consent Agenda.

7. Consider Appointing one (1) member to serve with the Chair and Vice Chair on the Executive Committee.

ACTION REQUESTED: Chair to appoint one (1) member to serve with the Chair and Vice Chair on the Executive Committee.

A motion was made by Supervisor Durfee and seconded by Supervisor Connelley to re-appoint Councilmember Tryon to serve on the Executive Committee with Supervisor Ritter and Councilmember Winslow.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly(second), Supervisor Durfee(motion), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow, Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

8. Consider Appointing two (2) members to serve as the Budget and Finance Committee.

ACTION REQUESTED: Chair to appoint two (2) members to serve as the Budget and Finance Committee.

A motion was made by Supervisor Connelly and seconded by Supervisor Durfee to re-appoint Councilmember Tryon and appoint Councilmember Winslow to serve as the Budget and Finance Committee.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly(motion), Supervisor Durfee(second), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow, Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

9. Consider Appointing a Representative and Alternate Representative to the Sacramento Valley Basinwide Air Pollution Control Council BCC.

ACTION REQUESTED: Chair to appoint one (1) Primary and one (1) Alternate to represent the District on the BCC.

A motion was made by Supervisor Durfee and seconded by Councilmember Winslow to re-appoint Supervisor Ritter as the Primary Representative and Supervisor Kimmelshue to serve as the Alternate on the BCC.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Durfee (motion), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow(second), Councilmember Tryon, Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

10. Following a Public Hearing, Consider Approving the Air Toxics “Hot Spots” Program 2023 Annual Report

ACTION REQUESTED: Following a Public Hearing, approve the report.

Board discussion: Board discussion ensued.

Public comments: None.

Public Hearing Opened: 10:06 a.m.

Public Hearing Closed: 10:10 a.m.

A motion was made by Supervisor Durfee and seconded by Councilmember Tryon to Approve the Air Toxics “Hot Spots” Program 2023 Annual Report.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Durfee(motion), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow, Councilmember Tryon(second), Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: None.

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

11. Position Classification & Compensation Study Proposal Review & Award

ACTION REQUESTED: Receive report and provide direction as needed.

Board comments: Board discussion ensued.

Public comments: None.

After a lengthy discussion the Board did not select any of the options provided in the Agenda report. Supervisor Ritter asked that the bargaining unit be brought into the conversation first and Councilmember Tryon asked the Bargaining unit to consider splitting the cost of both the classification and compensation studies or explore other alternatives including doing an in-house study. The board agreed with this direction.

12. District Program Cost & Fee Analysis

ACTION REQUESTED: Receive report and provide direction as needed.

Board comments: Board discussion ensued.

Public comments: None.

The Board chose option #2 provided in the Agenda report which is to amend and re-release the RFP after obtaining feedback from other districts and/or prospective consultants.

13. Butte County Collaborative Group MOU

ACTION REQUESTED: Receive report and authorize signing MOU.

Board Discussion: Board discussion ensued.

Public Comments: None

A motion was made by Supervisor Durfee and seconded by Councilmember Winslow to receive the report and authorize signing the MOU.

AYES: Supervisor Connelly, Supervisor Durfee(motion), Supervisor Ritter, Vice Mayor Nuchols, Councilmember Winslow(second), Vice Mayor Smith.

NOES: Councilmember Tryon

ABSTAIN: None.

ABSENT: Supervisor Kimmelshue, Supervisor Teeter, Councilmember Calderon

14. APCO Report

ACTION REQUESTED: None. This item is provided for information and discussion.

See addendum to the minutes for the report

Board Discussion: Board discussion ensued.

Public Comments: None

15. Other Business

16. Public Comment Period. Any person may address the Board of Directors on any matter within the jurisdiction of the Board that is not on the agenda for this meeting. Any person may address the Board on an agenda item when that time is called. The Chair requests that each person addressing the Board limits their presentation to five (5) minutes.

17. Adjourn to Closed Session. No closed session was held.

- 18. **Report From Closed Session.** None

- 19. **The meeting adjourned at 11:02 a.m. The next Board of Directors Meeting is scheduled for February 22, 2024 at 10:00 a.m. at the Butte County Association of Governments Board Room, 326 Huss Drive, Suite 100, Chico, California**



Stephen Ertle, Air Pollution Control Officer
Butte County Air Quality Management District

I hereby attest that this is a true and correct copy of the action taken by the Butte County Air Quality Management District Board of Directors on January 25, 2024.



ATTEST: _____
Kelly Towne, Clerk of the Governing Board

Attachment 1

APCO Report

January Stephen Ertle, APCO
APCO
Notes Federal

- Still waiting for the final NAAQS for PM2.5 (next working group meeting is Monday)
 - 2021: 11.14 ug/m3
 - 2022: 7.72
 - 2023: 7.83
 - Tentative Three Year Design Value: 8.89 – maybe 8.90
- Asbestos Demolition and Renovation (of commercial structures) went into effect Jan 1, 2024. District staff trained with Yolo Solano Air District (our program mirrors theirs) last week. We plan monthly outreach to our Building departments while we get up and running to refine processes.
- We are still tracking EPA revisions to the Air Emissions Reporting Requirements (AERR) Rule:
 - No new info at this point.

State

Budget: Governor showing 37.9B deficit: LAO December of 68B

The Governor's proposed budget is contained in two identical bills, AB 1812 (Gabriel) and SB 917 (Skinner). We have a much clearer picture of funding for CAPCOA's priorities. We'll keep you up to date with any noteworthy new information. Please don't hesitate to reach out if you have any questions.

AB 617

\$250M total in GGRF funding (down from the \$300M total in the 2023-24 adopted budget) broken down as follows:

Implementation

\$50M total (down from \$60M in 2023-24 adopted budget; Just a reminder that when the \$10M add-on was first provided in the 2022-23 budget, legislative staff represented to us that it was intended to be temporary so we may hear that as justification for the reduction)

Incentives

\$195M (down from \$234M in 2023-24 adopted budget)

Community Grants

\$5M total (down from \$6M in 2023-24 adopted budget)

- Retains language allowing grants to be used to support community participation, including activities that enable meeting attendance, in AB 617 CERPs (Community Emission Reduction Plan).

FARMER

No funding provided (down from \$75M GF in 2023-24 adopted budget; the Governor also zeroed it out in his proposed budget last year)

Woodsmoke Reduction Program

No funding provided

ARB adding forty six more positions to perform various duties.

Local

- Provided support letters for the following:
 - BCFSC Butte County Forest Resilience and Restoration Project
 - BCFSC Wildfire Safety Chipper Program
 - BCFSC Roadside Evacuation Hazardous Fuels Reduction
- Commercial Lawn and Garden Program has been very successful (looks fully subscribed).
- Residential program has had a slow start. We are planning additional outreach (Stay tuned).

CAPCOA Updates January 2024

- Proposing CTR (Criteria Pollutant and Toxics Emissions Reporting) training to help Rural Districts with rollout (with Large/Medium support)
- Working with CAPCOA Staff/CARB and Rural Districts to set annual calendar and Winter meeting Agenda
 - Budget/Funding (UAL/Program cost recovery)
 - Grants (Moyer Base Allocation)
 - State Reserve
 - CTR
 -
- CAPCOA Current Priorities/Activities:
 - State Budget
 - CAPCOA Submitted AERR Comment Letter
 - Working with CARB to make sure CPRG Grant categories are included
 - Working with State on top 5 project categories for the Priority Climate Action Plan (PCAP)
 - Spring 2024 Rx Fire Training planned.